

PIA 2434/3434: Civil-Military Relations

Spring 2014

Thursdays, 12-3pm, 3431 Posvar Hall

Professor: Ryan Grauer
Office: 3932 Posvar Hall
Office Hours: Wednesdays and Thursdays, 3-5pm
Email: grauer@pitt.edu
Phone: 412-624-7396

Course Description:

This course explores the relationship between militaries and the polities they serve. Militaries are crucial governmental institutions in the modern world, serving as the guardians of sovereignty and safety. However, militaries also possess the tools and capability to threaten the very people and polities they are meant to protect. Striking the proper balance between military capability and civilian control of the armed forces is therefore an essential task for all states. But how is this delicate balancing act to be achieved? What factors make success and failure in this venture more or less likely? In exploring these questions, we will examine classical theories of civil-military relations and the rebuttals they inspired. We will also consider some of the key issues in the study and practice of civil-military relations, including coups, the influence of civilians on conventional and irregular battlefield performance, and various “gaps” between military and civilian values and beliefs. We will conclude by examining the confluence of the various facets of the civil-military relationship and their manifestation during the Vietnam War and in the George W. Bush and Barack Obama administrations.

Assignments and Grading:

This course will be a true seminar; though I may share some material not covered in the readings on occasion, I will not spend any class time lecturing. Many of our meetings will consist of discussions in which we focus on teasing out both the precise arguments and counterarguments advanced in the readings, the validity and potential utility of the claims made by different scholars, and implications that might be derived for contemporary policymakers. A few will be dedicated to student-led presentations and discussions of contemporary issues in civil-military relations around the world.

Your grade will be based on the following three elements:

1. Three **reaction papers** (3-4 double-spaced pages), in which students respond to ideas, debates, conflicts, and contradictions in the material read for the week. The first paper will be written in response to a question distributed in class on January 30th and turned in during class on February 6th. The second and third papers will be written in response to

the readings and class discussion for a week of your choosing between February 6th and March 20th (inclusive). They will be turned in during class the week following the meeting covering the topic on which you have chosen to write. (30% of the total; 10% each)

2. A **research paper** of no more than 25 double-spaced pages. It is due at the beginning of our final meeting of the semester, April 24th. It may be on a topic of your choosing, provided that it addresses the concepts and problems we discuss during the course. It can take the form of a single or comparative case study, a quantitative assessment of theoretical claims, or some mixture. Your intended topic must be approved by me *no later than March 27th*. You will present your findings to the class and field questions about your topic during our final meeting. (50% of the total)
3. **Class participation**, which consists both of regular participation in seminar discussions and weekly emails sent to seminar participants by 9pm on Wednesdays before meetings listing 3-5 questions about the material that s/he would like to discuss. (20% of the total)

Your final grade will be assigned on the following scale:

A	=	93-100	B+	=	87-89	C+	=	77-79	D+	=	67-69
A-	=	90-92	B	=	83-86	C	=	73-76	D	=	65-66
			B-	=	80-82	C-	=	70-72	F	=	Below 65

Academic Integrity:

You are expected to adhere to all aspects of the University of Pittsburgh guidelines on academic integrity. Failure to cite external sources of ideas, concepts, and facts in written work will be penalized. Plagiarism will result in automatic failure of the course. For Pitt's written guidelines on academic integrity, visit: <http://www.provost.pitt.edu/info/acguidelinespdf.pdf>.

Required Books:

The following books have been ordered and are available at The Book Center. They can also be purchased (usually for less) on Amazon or some other online site. Note that the Avant book required for Week 7 is out of print. There is only one copy available at Hillman, so you may want to consider using EZ Borrow or Inter-Library Loan relatively early in the semester to ensure that you have a copy in time to prepare for our meeting that week.

H.R. McMaster, *Dereliction of Duty* (New York: HarperCollings, 1997).

Peter D. Feaver and Richard H. Kohn, eds., *Soldiers and Civilians: The Civil-Military Gap and American National Security* (Cambridge: MIT Press, 2001).

Peter D. Feaver and Christopher Gelpi, *Choosing Your Battles: American Civil-Military Relations and the Use of Force* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2004).

Dale Herspring, *Rumsfeld's Wars* (Lawrence, KS: University Press of Kansas, 2008).
Jason Dempsey, *Our Army: Soldiers, Politics, and American Civil-Military Relations*
(Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2010).
Bob Woodward, *Obama's Wars* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2010).

The other required readings for the course are available on CourseWeb.

Course Schedule

Week 1 (January 9): Introduction and Course Logistics [61]

Rosa Brooks, "Fog of War," *ForeignPolicy.com*, August 8, 2012.
Harold D. Lasswell, "The Garrison State," *American Journal of Sociology* 46, no. 4
(January, 1941): 455-468.
Harold D. Lasswell, "The Garrison State Hypothesis Today," in Samuel Huntington, ed.,
Changing Patterns of Military Politics (Glencoe: The Free Press, 1962): 51-70.
Gordon Craig, "The Political Leader as Strategist," in Peter Paret, ed., *Makers of Modern
Strategy from Machiavelli to the Nuclear Age* (Princeton: Princeton University
Press, 1986): 481-509.

General Issues

Week 2 (January 16): War-making States and State-making Wars [170]

Otto Hintze, "Military Organization and the Organization of the State," in Felix Gilbert,
ed., *The Historical Essays of Otto Hintze* (New York: Oxford University Press,
1975): 178-215.
Stanislav Andreski, *Military Organization and Society*, 2nd ed. (Berkeley: University of
California, 1968): Introduction, Chapters 1, 2, 8. (1-74, 124-133)
Charles Tilly, "War Making and State Making as Organized Crime," in Peter Evans,
Dietrich Rueschemeyer, & Theda Skocpol, eds., *Bringing the State Back In* (New
York: Cambridge University Press, 1985): 169-191.
Janice E. Thomson, "State Practices, International Norms, and the Decline of
Mercantilism," *International Studies Quarterly* 34, no. 1 (March, 1990): 23-47.

Week 3 (January 23): Classical General Theories [168]

Sun Tzu, *The Art of War*, trans. Samuel B. Griffith (New York: Oxford University Press,
1971): Chapter 3. (77-84)
Carl von Clausewitz, *On War* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984 [1832]): Book
I, Chapter 1; Book VIII, Chapter 6b. (75-89, 605-610)
Samuel Huntington, *The Soldier and the State* (Cambridge: Belknap Press of Harvard
University Press, 1957): Introduction, Chapters 1 – 5. (1-139)

Week 4 (January 30): Modern (and not-so Modern) Challenges to the Classics [227]

- Morris Janowitz, *The Professional Soldier* (New York: The Free Press, 1971 [1960]): Chapters 1 – 4 and 20. (3-75, 417-442)
- Peter D. Feaver, “The Civil-Military Problematique: Huntington, Janowitz, and the Question of Civilian Control,” *Armed Forces & Society* 23, no. 2 (Winter, 1996): 149-178.
- Michael Desch, *Civilian Control of the Military: the Changing Security Environment* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 1999): Chapters 1-2. (1-21)
- Eliot Cohen, “the Unequal Dialogue: The Theory and Reality of Civil-Military Relations and the Use of Force,” in *Soldiers and Civilians: The Civil-Military Gap and American National Security*, eds. Peter D. Feaver and Richard H. Kohn (Cambridge: MIT Press, 2001): 429-458.
- Christopher Gibson, “Enhancing National Security and Civilian Control of the Military: A Madisonian Approach,” in *American Civil-Military Relations: The Soldier and the State in a New Era*, ed. Suzanne Nielsen and Don Snider (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2009): 239-263.
- Richard Kohn, “Building Trust: Civil-Military Behaviors for Effective National Security,” in *American Civil-Military Relations: The Soldier and the State in a New Era*, ed. Suzanne Nielsen and Don Snider (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2009): 264-289.

Challenges, Perpetual and Contemporary

Week 5 (February 6): Coups d'état [262]

- Edward Luttwak, *Coup d'État: A Practical Handbook* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1969): Chapters 1-3. (3-101)
- Samuel Huntington, *Political Order in Changing Societies* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1968): Chapter 4. (192-263)
- Eric Nordlinger, *Soldiers in Politics: Military Coups and Governments* (Englewood Cliffs: Prentice Hall, 1977): Chapter 3. (63-107).
- James Quinlivan, “Coup-Proofing: Its Practice and Consequences in the Middle East,” *International Security* 24, no. 2 (Fall, 1999): 131-165.
- Jonathan Powell and Clayton Thyne, “Global Instances of Coups from 1950 to 2010,” *Journal of Peace Research* 48, no. 2 (March, 2011): 249-259.

Week 6 (February 13): Wartime Management and Effectiveness [233]

Management:

- Re-skim: Eliot Cohen, “The Unequal Dialogue: The Theory and Reality of Civil-Military Relations and the Use of Force,” in *Soldiers and Civilians*, Peter Feaver and Richard Kohn, eds. (Cambridge: MIT Press, 2001): 429-458.

Jack Snyder, "Civil-Military Relations and the Cult of the Offensive, 1914 and 1984," *International Security* 9, no. 1 (Summer, 1984): 108-146.

Barry Posen, *The Sources of Military Doctrine: France, Britain, and Germany between the World Wars* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1984): Chapter 7. (220-244)

Elizabeth Kier, "Culture and Military Doctrine: France Between the Wars," *International Security* 19, no. 4 (Spring, 1995): 65-93.

Stephen Peter Rosen, *Winning the Next War: Innovation and the Modern Military* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1991): Chapters 1, 9. (1-53, 251-261).

Effectiveness:

Stephen Biddle and Robert Zirkle, "Technology, Civil-Military Relations, and Warfare in the Developing World," *Journal of Strategic Studies* 19, no. 2 (June, 1996): 171-212.

Risa Brooks, "An Autocracy at War: Explaining Egypt's (in)Effectiveness in the 1967 and 1973 Arab-Israeli Wars" *Security Studies* 15, no. 3 (July-September 2006): 396-430.

Week 7 (February 20): Civilian Control in Irregular Wars [219]

*Deborah Avant, *Political Institutions and Military Change: Lessons from Peripheral Wars* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1994).

Robert Egnell, "Explaining US and British Performance in Complex Expeditionary Operations: The Civil-Military Dimension," *Journal of Strategic Studies* 29, no. 6 (December, 2006): 1041-1075.

Shawn T. Cochran, "The Civil-Military Divide in Protracted Small War: An Alternative View of Military Leadership Preferences and War Termination," *Armed Forces & Society* (2013): Online First.

Charles J. Dunlap, Jr., "The Origins of the American Military Coup of 2012," *Parameters* 22, no. 4 (Winter, 1992-1993): 2-20.

* Out of Print; use the Library, EZ Borrow, and Inter-Library Loan early and often

Week 8 (February 27): The Civil-Military Gap I [262]

Peter D. Feaver and Richard H. Kohn, eds., *Soldiers and Civilians: The Civil-Military Gap and American National Security* (Cambridge: MIT Press, 2001): Introduction, 1, 3, 7, 8, 10, 11, 13.

Week 9 (March 6): The Civil-Military Gap II [205]

Jason Dempsey, *Our Army: Soldiers, Politics, and American Civil-Military Relations* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2010).

No Class March 13: Spring Break

Week 10 (March 20): The Civil-Military Gap III [214]

Peter D. Feaver and Christopher Gelpi, *Choosing Your Battles: American Civil-Military Relations and the Use of Force* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2004).

No Class Week 11 (March 27): Professor Grauer at ISA Annual Convention

Begin reading for Weeks 12-14, as the reading load is much heavier than previous weeks.

American Civil-Military Relations: Vietnam, Bush, and Obama

Week 12 (April 3): Vietnam [334]

H.R. McMaster, *Dereliction of Duty* (New York: HarperCollins, 1997).

Week 13 (April 10): Bush, Rumsfeld, and the Generals [213]

Dale Herspring, *Rumsfeld's Wars* (Lawrence, KS: University Press of Kansas, 2008).

Week 14 (April 17): Obama and the Surge [380]

Bob Woodward, *Obama's Wars* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2010).

Week 15 (April 24): Student Presentations